

Citizenship and Belonging to Canada: Dual citizens do not have weaker sense of belonging to Canada

Jack Jedwab

Executive Director

Association for Canadian Studies

For Publication

August 13th, 2007

Summary

Certain categories of dual citizens often have stronger sense of belonging to Canada than those with Canadian citizenship only.

Canadians second amongst 35 countries in degree to which they regard citizenship as important.

Francophone Canadians were more likely than Anglophone Canadians to agree that Canadians take their citizenship for granted.

Non-immigrants have little awareness of the principal conditions in securing Canadian citizenship.

Dual citizenship occurs when a person is the citizen of more than one country. Canadian law permits this, but not all other countries legally recognize dual citizenship with Canada. Debates over dual citizenship in Canada have been the object of increased attention since the evacuation of Canadian citizens from Lebanon in the summer of 2006. It has been contended that these purportedly long time Lebanese residents used Canada as a temporary haven and invoked their Canadian citizenship so as to call upon the government of Canada to fulfill its obligations to rescue them. The issues raised by the evacuation have since evolved and become intertwined with debates around

immigrant integration and multiculturalism. Some have contended that dual citizenship invites dual loyalties and by consequence undercuts one's sense of belonging to Canada. Hence the Governor-General and the Leader of the opposition in the House of Commons were called upon by significant segments of the population to renounce their French citizenship in order to discourage such practice.

A number of opinion surveys have inquired into whether Canadians favour dual citizenship and more recently on behalf of the Dominion Institute, the firm Ipsos found that some four in ten Canadians disapproved of the practice.

To-date few analysts have tested the relationship between dual citizenship and the sense of belonging to Canada. Some have pleaded that there is no source of data that permits us to measure the relationship. But in fact there exists a dataset that permits insight into the relationship. The Ethnic Diversity Survey (EDS) conducted by Statistics Canada has a significant number of respondents that hold dual citizenship. That which follows uses special tabulations from the survey and examines the relationship between single and dual citizenship and belonging to Canada. We further look at the language of respondents, world region of birth, recency of immigration, generational status, number of trips taken by immigrant to country of birth, visible minority status and ethnic background. All these characteristics are considered in conjunction with citizenship to determine whether they have influence on the sense of belonging to Canada. According to the 2001 census some 690 000 Canadians hold dual citizenship.

Since the vast majority of Quebecers do not have dual citizenship and collectively have a lower sense of belonging to Canada than persons residing elsewhere in the country, the findings are broken down in the table below on the basis of one's principal language. As observed below some 85% of those who speak primarily English and possess only Canadian citizenship reported a strong sense of belonging to Canada (ranked 4 and 5 on a five-point scale) compared with 82% with dual citizenship. Some 57% of francophones with Canadian citizenship only reported a strong sense of belonging to Canada compared with some 68% holding dual citizenship. Of those whose principal language is neither English nor French, some 66% of those holding Canadian citizenship only reported a strong sense of belonging to Canada compared with 78% that reported dual citizenship. It is interesting to note that francophones holding dual citizenship were more likely than those holding single citizenship to have a strong sense of belonging to Canada.

Sense of Belonging to Canada * Citizenship - Canada and/or other countries *

Language of interview

Language of interview	Sense of belonging to Canada	Canada only	Canada and country of birth (other than Canada) with or without other countries
English	1 - not strong at all	2.10%	1.80%
		2.30%	2.80%
		8.90%	11.00%
		19.40%	22.90%
	5 - very strong	65.40%	58.90%
	Total Count	29786	2837
French	1 - not strong at all	9.00%	8.00%
		9.60%	4.90%
		21.70%	14.80%
		21.00%	22.80%
	5 - very strong	36.50%	45.30%
Total Count	5133	386	
Other	1 - not strong at all	1.50%	2.60%
		2.50%	1.60%
		12.90%	6.30%
		19.30%	17.20%
	5 - very strong	46.20%	60.40%
	Total Count	612	192

Source: Ethnic Diversity Survey, Statistics Canada, 2002

On the basis of place of birth only those born in the United States (84%) and to a lesser extent those born in Canada (74%) that possess dual citizenship have a somewhat lesser sense of belonging to Canada than those born in the United States (72%) and Canada with single citizenship (80%)

Cross-tabulation: Sense of Belonging to Canada * Citizenship - Canada and/or other countries * Derived - Place of birth - World regions (7)

Place of birth - World regions	Sense of belonging to Canada	Canada only	Canada and country of birth (other than Canada) with or without other countries
Canada	1 - not strong at all	3.40%	4.10%
		3.60%	6.30%
		11.40%	14.50%
		20.10%	24.20%
	5 - very strong	59.90%	49.50%
	Total Count	29810	763
United States	1 - not strong at all	1.60%	3.30%
		3.70%	3.80%
		7.30%	18.30%
		15.70%	27.10%
	5 - very strong	68.10%	44.60%
	Total Count	191	240
Central America, South America, Caribbean and Bermuda	1 - not strong at all	1.00%	1.70%
		2.60%	2.50%

		7.80%	9.00%
		18.30%	18.50%
	5 - very strong	66.00%	65.00%
	Total Count	574	357
Europe	1 - not strong at all	1.40%	2.00%
		1.30%	1.20%
		4.80%	7.50%
		13.50%	21.70%
	5 - very strong	73.10%	63.50%
	Total Count	2513	1279
Africa	1 - not strong at all	1.70%	0.90%
		0.90%	0.90%
		7.30%	6.90%
		11.50%	19.80%
	5 - very strong	71.80%	68.10%
	Total Count	234	116
Asia and the Middle East	1 - not strong at all	1.50%	2.20%
		2.60%	2.60%
		11.20%	14.10%
		21.80%	22.10%
	5 - very strong	56.40%	54.40%
	Total Count	2089	583

Immigrant time of arrival plays a role in sense of belonging to Canada. About 85% of those immigrants arriving before 1991 with Canadian citizenship only and those with dual citizenship reported a strong sense of belonging to Canada compared with approximately 75% that arrived between 1991 and 2001 and possess either single or dual citizenship.

Cross-tabulation: Sense of Belonging to Canada * Citizenship - Canada and/or other countries * Year of arrival for first generation

Year of arrival for first generation	Sense of belonging to Canada	Canada only	Canada and country of birth (other than Canada) with or without other countries
Before 1991	1 - not strong at all	1.30%	1.90%
		1.70%	1.60%
		6.90%	9.30%
		16.10%	20.70%
	5 - very strong	68.30%	62.60%
	Total Count	4837	2022
1991 to 2001	1 - not strong at all	2.00%	2.50%
		3.40%	2.80%
		12.70%	12.50%
		23.10%	26.90%
	5 - very strong	52.70%	51.40%
	Total Count	787	599

Source: Ethnic Diversity Survey, Statistics Canada, 2002

An indicator of the connection of an immigrant to their country of origin is the degree of contact with that country. In the table below we measure one dimension of this relationship by the number of trips taken to the country of birth. Again the number of trips to country of birth does not have any impact on the strength of belonging to Canada.

Cross-tabulation: Sense of Belonging to Canada * Citizenship - Canada and/or other countries * Number of trips to country of birth

Number of trips to country of birth	Sense of belonging to Canada	Canada only	Canada and country of birth (other than Canada) with or without other countries
once only?	1 - not strong at all	1.60%	2.10%
		2.40%	2.10%
		8.50%	9.00%
		17.50%	21.20%
	5 - very strong	66.30%	61.30%
	Total Count	1030	424
2 to 4 times?	1 - not strong at all	1.80%	1.40%
		2.00%	2.20%
		8.50%	10.50%
		16.30%	23.80%
	5 - very strong	66.80%	59.80%
	Total Count	1641	759
5 to 9 times?	1 - not strong at all	0.80%	2.40%
		1.50%	2.00%
		6.40%	11.90%

		19.70%	22.30%
	5 - very strong	67.30%	58.90%
	Total Count	737	453
10 times or more?	1 - not strong at all	1.60%	1.40%
		1.40%	1.60%
		5.80%	10.50%
		15.30%	23.00%
	5 - very strong	73.30%	61.70%
	Not asked	7	7
	Total Count	636	561

Source: Ethnic Diversity Survey, Statistics Canada, 2002

On the basis of visible minority identification only those who identify as Chinese that hold dual citizenship have a lower sense of belonging to Canada than those of that origin holding only Canadian citizenship. South Asians scored as the demographic with the strongest sense of belonging to Canada. Amongst the Black respondents, some 80% of dual citizens reported a strong sense of belonging to Canada versus some 72% with Canadian citizenship only. Similarly, Latin America respondents with dual citizenship or respondents who claimed only Canadian citizenship had a lower sense of belonging (77%) than those who claimed dual or other citizenships (82%).

Cross-tabulation: Sense of Belonging to Canada * Citizenship Canada and/or other countries * Chinese, South Asian and Black

Chinese, South Asian, Black, Latin American or Not a VM	Sense of Belonging to Canada	Canada only	Canada and country of birth (other than Canada) with or without other countries
Not in a visible minority	1 - not strong at all	3.20%	2.70%
		3.30%	3.00%
		10.10%	10.00%
		18.50%	23.50%
	5 - very strong	63.00%	57.90%
	Total Count	29164	2291
Chinese	1 - not strong at all	1.90%	2.50%
		2.90%	5.90%
		16.60%	23.90%
		31.70%	33.20%
	5 - very strong	43.50%	32.40%
		1801	238
South Asian	1 - not strong at all	1.50%	4.20%
		2.50%	1.10%
		10.50%	6.80%
		21.40%	12.10%

	5 - very strong	59.20%	70.00%
	Total Count	1299	190
Black	1 - not strong at all	5.50%	2.40%
		4.90%	2.90%
		13.90%	12.90%
		21.50%	21.00%
	5 - very strong	50.70%	58.10%
	Total Count	995	210

Source: Ethnic Diversity Survey, Statistics Canada, 2002

Finally on the basis of non-Christian religions Muslims (81%) and Jews (83%) with only Canadian citizenship had similar rates of belonging to Canada. Amongst those with dual citizenship at 84% Muslims have a higher rate of belonging than those with single citizenship whereas Jews with dual citizenship at 80% (rated 4 and 5) have a slightly lower sense of belonging than those with single citizenship.

Cross-tabulation: Sense of Belonging to Canada * Citizenship – Canada and/or other countries * Jews Muslims and Others

Jews, Muslims and Others	Sense of belonging to Canada	Canada only	Canada and country of birth (other than Canada) with or without other countries
Muslims	1 - not strong at all	1.30%	2.90%
		2.80%	0.80%
		9.30%	6.10%
		23.00%	17.10%
	5 - very strong	58.00%	67.30%
	Total	400	245

	Count		
Jews	1 - not strong at all	1.50%	0.00%
		2.50%	1.50%
		9.80%	15.40%
		22.90%	38.50%
	5 - very strong	60.40%	41.50%
	Total Count	551	65
All Others	1 - not strong at all	3.10%	2.60%
		3.40%	3.20%
		10.80%	11.40%
		19.50%	22.70%
	5 - very strong	60.90%	57.00%
	Total Count	34580	3105

Source: Ethnic Diversity Survey, Statistics Canada, 2002

Some analysts maintain that dual or multiple identities result in the diluting of each individual expression of identity. As applied to citizenship therefore where it can dually held it might be assumed that the importance of such citizenship is undercut. Yet in the Canadian case an international survey conducted in 2004 reveals that Canada ranks second amongst some thirty five countries in the importance it attributes to having citizenship

Important: To have [Country Nationality] citizenship Crosstabulation

	Very important	Fairly important	Not very important	Not important at all
United States (US)	82.8%	13.2%	3.1%	.9%
Canada (CA)	76.8%	18.6%	3.6%	1.0%

Philippines (PH)	73.7%	22.4%	3.2%	.8%
Venezuela (VE)	73.0%	23.3%	2.8%	.8%
Chile (CL)	68.4%	23.3%	7.3%	.9%
Uruguay (UY)	64.1%	23.7%	11.0%	1.2%
Austria (AT)	63.0%	27.3%	7.7%	2.0%
New Zealand (NZ)	62.2%	27.3%	7.8%	2.7%
Ireland (IE)	60.5%	31.2%	6.1%	2.3%
Israel Jews (IL-J)	59.5%	27.5%	8.4%	4.7%
Australia (AU)	57.4%	32.5%	7.5%	2.6%
Russia (RU)	57.4%	30.4%	8.7%	3.5%
France (FR)	56.8%	28.9%	9.5%	4.8%
Norway (NO)	56.7%	32.8%	7.8%	2.8%
South Africa (ZA)	54.2%	39.0%	3.4%	3.4%
Total Universe	54.2%	33.1%	9.6%	3.1%
Poland (PL)	52.7%	38.6%	7.5%	1.2%
Japan (JP)	52.7%	34.0%	10.7%	2.6%
Denmark (DK)	51.4%	33.7%	12.2%	2.7%
Sweden (SE)	51.3%	30.5%	12.9%	5.2%
Great Britain (GB)	50.2%	37.0%	9.9%	2.9%
Bulgaria (BG)	50.2%	38.8%	9.1%	1.8%
Finland (FI)	49.9%	34.2%	12.5%	3.4%
South Korea (KR)	48.1%	39.6%	11.5%	.8%
Slovenia (SI)	46.8%	35.3%	12.4%	5.6%
Czech Republic (CZ)	45.7%	41.0%	10.4%	2.9%
Taiwan (TW)	44.6%	35.4%	14.7%	5.3%
Portugal (PT)	43.3%	48.9%	6.7%	1.1%
Hungary (HU)	41.9%	35.5%	16.7%	5.9%
Switzerland (CH)	41.5%	37.9%	15.2%	5.3%
Germany	38.9%	40.4%	15.1%	5.6%
Latvia (LV)	36.8%	34.3%	21.8%	7.1%
Spain (ES)	36.7%	51.5%	9.1%	2.6%
Slovak Republic (SK)	32.9%	37.9%	21.2%	8.0%

Source: International Social Survey Programme, 2004

And while Quebecers are somewhat less likely to agree that it is very important to have the country's citizenship they would still rank within the top ten in the 35 countries.

Important: To have [Country Nationality] citizenship Crosstabulation

% within Region: Canada		Very important	Fairly important
Region: Canada	Newfoundland	80.6%	17.9%
	Nova Scotia	77.2%	21.1%
	Prince Edward Island	86.2%	12.6%
	New Brunswick	88.0%	12.0%
	Quebec	59.9%	29.4%
	Ontario	82.9%	14.3%
	Manitoba	82.4%	14.7%
	Saskatchewan	84.0%	12.3%
	Alberta	76.6%	20.8%
	British Colombia	80.2%	15.8%
Total		76.8%	18.6%

Source: ISSP, Carleton University, 2004

Returning to the recent survey on dual citizenship as revealed below it is British Columbians and Quebecers that are most likely to favor dual citizenship. Younger Canadians are more likely than older ones to favor dual citizenship.

Do you think Canadian citizens should, or should not, be allowed to hold citizenship of a country other than Canada?

N=3164	Should	Should Not
Total	61	39
18-34	75	25
35-54	61	39
55+	50	50
British Columbia	66	34
Alberta	57	43
Sask/Man	61	39
Ontario	59	41
Quebec	65	35
Atlantic	62	38

Source: Ipsos for the Dominion Institute, 2007

According to a 2005 Ipsos survey conducted for Citizenship and Immigration Canada, second and third generation (plus) Canadians (83%) were more likely to agree that Canadians take their citizenship for granted than immigrants (72%).

Many Canadians take their citizenship for granted	Did either you or your parents immigrate to Canada from another country?				
	Yes, Self	Yes, Both	Yes, Parents (second generation)	No (third Generation or More)	Total
Strongly disagree	6.9%	8.5%	5.3%	6.6%	6.6%
Somewhat disagree	12.6%	4.9%	5.8%	5.6%	6.1%
Neither agree or disagree	4.6%	3.7%	4.3%	3.4%	3.7%
Somewhat agree	27.6%	37.8%	27.5%	27.8%	28.4%
Strongly agree	43.7%	45.1%	56.5%	55.9%	54.3%
Don't know/Refused	4.6%	-	.5%	.7%	1.0%

Source: Ipsos for Citizenship and Immigration Canada, Special Tabulations, June 2005

Francophone Canadians (85%) were more likely than Anglophone Canadians (82%) to agree that Canadians take their citizenship for granted.

Many Canadians take their citizenship for granted. *	Language		
	English	French	Total
Strongly disagree	7.6%	2.2%	6.6%
Somewhat disagree	6.5%	4.4%	6.1%
Neither agree or disagree	3.1%	6.1%	3.7%

Somewhat agree	26.9%	34.6%	28.4%
Strongly agree	55.1%	50.9%	54.3%
Don't know/Refused	.8%	1.8%	1.0%
	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

Source: Ipsos for Citizenship and Immigration Canada, Special Tabulations, June 2005

Just over half of Canadians believe that the Government of Canada is doing a good job at encouraging newcomers to apply for Canadian Citizenship.

Rate the performance of immigration program at Encouraging newcomers to apply for Canadian Citizenship?	Did either you or your parents immigrate to Canada from another country?				
	Yes, Self	Yes, Both	Yes, Parents	No	Total
Very poor	5.7%	4.9%	2.9%	2.9%	3.2%
Poor	9.2%	18.3%	10.6%	8.7%	9.7%
Fair	29.9%	23.2%	30.0%	29.8%	29.3%
Good	24.1%	34.1%	34.3%	39.2%	37.0%
Very good	27.6%	13.4%	13.5%	12.4%	13.7%
Don't know/Refused	3.4%	6.1%	8.7%	6.9%	7.0%

Source: Ipsos for Citizenship and Immigration Canada, Special Tabulations, June 2005

Finally it is worth noting that non-immigrants have little awareness of the principal conditions in securing Canadian citizenship.

**What are the requirements for becoming a Canadian citizen? (First Mention) * 20.
Did either you or your parents immigrate to Canada from another country?
Crosstabulation**

% within 20. Did either you or your parents immigrate to Canada from another country?

Yes, Self	Yes, Both	Yes, Parents	No	Total	
Having 3 year residency in Canada	33.3%	8.5%	2.4%	1.3%	4.3%
Having 5 year residency in Canada	5.7%	3.7%	4.8%	2.9%	3.5%
Having residency for so many years/ living in Canada for num	2.3%	8.5%	9.7%	11.2%	10.1%
Abide by/ knowledge of Canadian laws	4.6%	1.2%	3.9%	4.9%	4.4%
Being born in Canada/ by birth	6.9%	14.6%	12.6%	12.3%	12.1%
Clean background/ criminal check/ no criminal record	5.7%	6.1%	8.2%	7.0%	7.1%
Complete a written test/ pass the written test	2.3%	2.4%	2.9%	3.4%	3.2%
Having employment/ a steady job	2.3%	3.7%	1.9%	2.6%	2.5%
Having knowledge/ background information about Canada and it	6.9%	8.5%	9.2%	5.2%	6.2%
Can speak the language (unspecified)		3.7%	1.0%	1.2%	1.2%
Can speak English	2.3%		.5%	1.0%	.9%
Can speak French				.5%	.3%
Marry a Canadian citizen			.5%	.5%	.4%
Medical/ health qualifications			1.0%	.5%	.5%
Having to apply for citizenship	1.1%	3.7%	2.4%	1.0%	1.4%
Having a good education (unspecified)		1.2%	1.0%	.5%	.6%
Have to fill out an application form	1.1%	1.2%		.5%	.5%
To be a good citizen (unspecified)	2.3%	2.4%	.5%	.7%	.9%
Having job skills		1.2%		.5%	.4%
Be a loyal Canadian/ swear allegiance to Canada	1.1%	2.4%	1.0%	1.3%	1.3%

Accept Canadian culture/ values	1.1%		2.4%	1.2%	1.3%
Be a landed immigrant/ refugee	3.4%	4.9%	.5%	1.6%	1.7%
Be sponsored			1.0%	.2%	.3%
Attend (citizenship) classes/ study			1.0%	1.2%	1.0%
Ability to support yourself		1.2%	.5%	.4%	.4%
Other	9.2%	8.5%	12.6%	8.5%	9.2%
Nothing			.5%	.6%	.5%
Dk/ns	8.0%	12.2%	18.4%	27.3%	23.5%
	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

Source: Ipsos for Citizenship and Immigration Canada, Special Tabulations, June 2005